

---

ATTI ACCADEMIA NAZIONALE LINCEI CLASSE SCIENZE FISICHE MATEMATICHE NATURALI

# RENDICONTI LINCEI MATEMATICA E APPLICAZIONI

---

BERNARD DACOROGNA, NICOLA FUSCO, LUC  
TARTAR

**On the solvability of the equation  $\operatorname{div} u = f$  in  $L^1$   
and in  $C^0$**

*Atti della Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei. Classe di Scienze Fisiche,  
Matematiche e Naturali. Rendiconti Lincei. Matematica e  
Applicazioni, Serie 9, Vol. 14 (2003), n.3, p. 239–245.*

Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei

[<http://www.bdim.eu/item?id=RLIN\\_2003\\_9\\_14\\_3\\_239\\_0>](http://www.bdim.eu/item?id=RLIN_2003_9_14_3_239_0)

L'utilizzo e la stampa di questo documento digitale è consentito liberamente per motivi di ricerca e studio. Non è consentito l'utilizzo dello stesso per motivi commerciali. Tutte le copie di questo documento devono riportare questo avvertimento.

---

*Articolo digitalizzato nel quadro del programma  
bdim (Biblioteca Digitale Italiana di Matematica)  
SIMAI & UMI*

<http://www.bdim.eu/>

Atti della Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei. Classe di Scienze Fisiche, Matematiche e Naturali. Rendiconti Lincei. Matematica e Applicazioni, Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, 2003.

BERNARD DACOROGNA - NICOLA FUSCO - LUC TARTAR

# ON THE SOLVABILITY OF THE EQUATION $\operatorname{div} u = f$ IN $L^1$ AND IN $C^0$

ABSTRACT. — We show that the equation  $\operatorname{div} u = f$  has, in general, no Lipschitz (respectively  $W^{1,1}$ ) solution if  $f$  is  $C^0$  (respectively  $L^1$ ).

KEY WORDS: Divergence; Lorentz spaces; Sobolev imbedding theorem.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Consider a bounded open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  and a vector field  $u : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ . Define the linear operator  $L : X \rightarrow Y$  by

$$Lu(x) = \operatorname{div} u = \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\partial u_i}{\partial x_i}.$$

Usually this operator is coupled with some boundary conditions but we will be concerned here only with a local problem of regularity. It is well known that this operator is onto (as a direct consequence of classical regularity results on Laplace equation) in the following cases

$$X = C^{k+1, \alpha}, Y = C^{k, \alpha} \quad \text{with } k \geq 0 \text{ and } 0 < \alpha < 1$$

$$X = W^{k+1, p}, Y = W^{k, p} \quad \text{with } k \geq 0 \text{ and } 1 < p < \infty.$$

The aim of this report is to show that this operator is *not* onto when

$$X = C^1 \text{ (or } W^{1, \infty}), Y = C^0$$

$$X = W^{1, 1}, Y = L^1.$$

It may seem that this follows at once from the known counterexamples for Laplace equation; this is not the case because the equation  $\operatorname{div} u = f$  has other solutions than the one of the form  $u = \operatorname{grad} v$ .

After having solved the problem we have learnt that both questions have already been studied by several authors. The result concerning  $C^0$  and  $L^\infty$  have been proved (to the best of our knowledge) by Preiss [6], Mc Mullen [4] and have been announced by Bourgain and Brézis in [2], who also mention the case of  $L^1$ .

2. THE  $L^1$  CASE: A FIRST APPROACH

Let

$$\psi(x_1, x_2) = x_1 x_2 V(|x|)$$

then

$$\begin{aligned}\psi_{x_1 x_1} &= \frac{x_1^3 x_2}{|x|^2} V''(|x|) + \frac{x_1 x_2}{|x|^3} (2x_1^2 + 3x_2^2) V'(|x|) \\ \psi_{x_2 x_2} &= \frac{x_2^3 x_1}{|x|^2} V''(|x|) + \frac{x_1 x_2}{|x|^3} (2x_2^2 + 3x_1^2) V'(|x|) \\ \psi_{x_1 x_2} &= \frac{x_1^2 x_2^2}{|x|^2} V''(|x|) + \frac{x_1^4 + x_1^2 x_2^2 + x_2^4}{|x|^3} V'(|x|) + V(|x|).\end{aligned}$$

Choosing  $\Omega = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^2: |x| < 1/2\}$  and for  $0 < \alpha < 1$ ,

$$V(r) = |\log r|^\alpha$$

we get that

$$\psi_{x_1 x_1}, \psi_{x_2 x_2} \in C^0(\Omega), \quad \psi_{x_1 x_2} \notin L^\infty(\Omega).$$

– Let  $\eta \in C_0^\infty(\Omega)$  and  $\eta \equiv 1$  near  $|x| = 0$ . Define for  $N$  an integer

$$\psi^N(x) = \eta(x) x_1 x_2 V\left(\frac{1}{N} + |x|\right).$$

Observe that  $\psi^N \in C_0^\infty(\Omega)$  and there exists a constant  $c_1$  independent of  $N$  so that

$$|\psi_{x_1 x_1}^N|_{L^\infty} + |\psi_{x_2 x_2}^N|_{L^\infty} \leq c_1.$$

– We have furthermore, for  $u = (u^1, u^2) \in W^{1,1}(\Omega; \mathbb{R}^2)$ , that

$$\iint_{\Omega} (u_{x_1}^1 + u_{x_2}^2) \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 = \iint_{\Omega} (u_{x_2}^1 \psi_{x_1 x_1}^N + u_{x_1}^2 \psi_{x_2 x_2}^N) dx_1 dx_2$$

and thus there exists a constant  $c_2 = c_2(c_1, \|u\|_{W^{1,1}})$  independent of  $N$  so that

$$\left| \iint_{\Omega} \operatorname{div} u \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 \right| \leq c_2.$$

– However if we choose

$$f(x) = \frac{1}{|x|^2 |\log |x||^{a+1}}$$

we get that  $f \in L^1(\Omega)$  and, for  $\psi^N$  as above, we get by Fatou lemma that

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \left| \iint_{\Omega} f \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 \right| = \infty.$$

The combination of the above facts leads to the desired conclusion.

### 3. THE $L^1$ CASE: A SECOND APPROACH

We start by recalling the definition of Lorentz spaces.

Let  $u : \Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  ( $\Omega$  a bounded open set) be measurable; we then define the distribution function by

$$\lambda(s) = \operatorname{meas} \{x \in \Omega : |u(x)| \geq s\}$$

and the decreasing rearrangement of  $u$  by

$$u^*(t) = \inf \{s : \lambda(s) < t\}, \quad t \in [0, |\Omega|].$$

If  $1 \leq p, q < \infty$  we define the Lorentz space  $L^{p,q}(\Omega)$  to be the space of  $u$  such that

$$|u|_{L^{p,q}} = \left( \int_0^{|\Omega|} u^*(t)^q t^{\frac{q}{p}-1} dt \right)^{1/q} < \infty$$

and if  $q = \infty$

$$|u|_{L^{p,\infty}} = \operatorname{ess\,sup} \left[ u^*(t) t^{\frac{1}{p}} \right] < \infty.$$

In particular  $L^{p,p}$  can be identified with  $L^p$ .

We now give an example that will be used below.

**PROPOSITION 1.** *Let  $\Omega = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : 0 < |x| < 1/2\}$ . Let  $\eta \in C^\infty(0, 1/2)$  be such that*

$$\eta(t) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{near } t = 0 \\ 0 & \text{near } t = 1/2. \end{cases}$$

Let

$$V(r) = - \int_{1/2}^r \frac{\varrho^{1-n}}{\log \varrho} d\varrho, \quad 0 < r < 1/2$$

$$\varphi(x) = \eta(|x|) V(|x|)$$

(note that, when  $n = 2$ ,  $V(|x|) = \log |\log |x|| - \log \log 2$ ). Call

$$f(x) = \Delta \varphi(x) = \begin{cases} (|x|^n \log^2 |x|)^{-1} & \text{near } |x| = 0 \\ 0 & \text{near } |x| = 1/2. \end{cases}$$

Then  $f \in L^1(\Omega)$  and  $\varphi$  solves, in the sense of distributions,

$$(1) \quad \begin{cases} \Delta \varphi = f & \text{in } \Omega \\ \varphi = 0 & \text{on } \partial \Omega. \end{cases}$$

Note however that  $\nabla \varphi \notin L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}(\Omega)$  and that, in the case  $n = 2$ ,  $\varphi \notin L^\infty(\Omega)$ .

REMARK 2. More refined examples show that solutions of (1) have their gradients in  $L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, \infty}(\Omega)$  but not in  $L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, q}(\Omega)$  for every  $q < \infty$ .

PROOF. Clearly  $f \in L^1(\Omega)$  and  $\varphi \notin L^\infty(\Omega)$  when  $n = 2$ . We therefore only check that  $\nabla \varphi \notin L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}(\Omega)$ . We have

$$\nabla \varphi(x) = [\eta(|x|) V'(|x|) + \eta'(|x|) V(|x|)] \frac{x}{|x|}$$

and hence the result will follow if we can show that  $\psi \notin L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}(0, r_0)$ , for  $r_0 > 0$  sufficiently small, where  $(\omega_n)$  denoting the measure of the unit ball

$$\psi(t) = V' \left( \left( \frac{t}{\omega_n} \right)^{1/n} \right) = \frac{\left( \frac{t}{\omega_n} \right)^{\frac{1-n}{n}}}{\frac{1}{n} \log \left( \frac{t}{\omega_n} \right)}.$$

We therefore have

$$|\psi|_{L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}} \equiv \int_0^{r_0} |\psi(t)| t^{-\frac{1}{n}} dt = n(\omega_n)^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \int_0^{r_0} \frac{dt}{t(\log t - \log \omega_n)} = \infty. \quad \square$$

The combination of the preceding counterexample and the following proposition gives the result for the  $L^1$  case.

PROPOSITION 3. Let  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  be the unit ball and let  $u \in W^{1,1}(\Omega; \mathbb{R}^n)$ . Then there exists a solution, in the sense of distributions, of

$$(2) \quad \begin{cases} \Delta \varphi = \operatorname{div} u & \text{in } \Omega \\ \varphi = 0 & \text{on } \partial \Omega. \end{cases}$$

Furthermore  $\nabla \varphi \in L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}(\Omega)$  and hence in particular, when  $n=2$ ,  $\varphi$  is continuous.

PROOF. We just sketch the main ingredients of the proof.

– The first fact is that a more refined version of the Sobolev imbedding theorem gives that  $u \in W^{1,1}$  implies  $u \in L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}$ , cf. [9].

– Using the Green function  $G = G(x, y)$  (cf. [3]) and applying the divergence theorem we can write the solution in terms of singular integrals, namely

$$\varphi(x) = \int_{\Omega} \operatorname{div} u(y) G(x, y) dy = - \int_{\Omega} \langle u(y); \nabla_y G(x, y) \rangle dy.$$

– The estimate on the gradient can be obtained as follows. Let  $Tu = \nabla \varphi = \left( \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial x_1}, \dots, \frac{\partial \varphi}{\partial x_n} \right)$ . Standard results on singular integrals (cf. [7, Theorem 3, Chapter II, p. 39]), show that for every  $1 < p < \infty$  we can find a constant  $c_p$  such that

$$|Tu|_{L^p} \leq c_p |u|_{L^p}.$$

– Since  $u \in L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}$  we can use Marcinkiewicz interpolation theorem (see Theorem 5.3.2 in [1, p. 113] or Theorem 3.15 of Chapter V in [8, p. 197]) to find a constant  $c'_{n/(n-1)}$  such that

$$|\nabla \varphi|_{L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}} = |Tu|_{L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}} \leq c'_{\frac{n}{n-1}} |u|_{L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}}.$$

The result then follows.  $\square$

REMARK 4. It is interesting to compare the two arguments that have been used in this section and in the preceding one.

The second method only uses the fact that  $W^{1,1} \subset L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}$  and shows that not all functions of  $L^1$  are divergences of functions in  $L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}$ . It essentially uses the convolution by the elementary solution of the Laplacian, which has a singularity of the form  $r^{2-n}$  (or  $\log r$  if  $n=2$ ). One easily generalizes this fact. Note first that if  $a$  has derivatives that belong to  $L^{n, \infty}$  (so that  $a \in \operatorname{BMO}$ ) then  $\operatorname{div} u * a = \sum u^j * a_{x_j}$  (after truncation) is continuous. However  $f * a$  cannot be continuous for all  $f \in L^1$  unless  $a$  is bounded.

The first method uses a larger class of functions  $a$  (the  $\psi_{x_1 x_2}$  of the counterexample), those that satisfy  $a_{x_j} \in W^{-1, \infty}$  for all  $j$  (note that since  $W_0^{1,1}$  is dense in  $L^{\frac{n}{n-1}, 1}$  we have  $L^{n, \infty} \subset W^{-1, \infty}$ ). Indeed if  $f = \operatorname{div} u$  with  $u \in W_0^{1,1}$  then  $\langle f; a \rangle = - \sum \langle u^j; a_{x_j} \rangle$  is well defined.

#### 4. THE CONTINUOUS CASE

We recall an example due to Ornstein [5] (Mc Mullen uses the more abstract version of Ornstein theorem to prove his result).

Let  $N \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\Omega = (0, 1)^2$  then there exists  $\psi^N = \psi^N(x_1, x_2) \in C_0^\infty(\Omega)$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} |\psi_{x_1 x_1}^N|_{L^1} + |\psi_{x_2 x_2}^N|_{L^1} &= 1 \\ N(|\psi_{x_1 x_1}^N|_{L^1} + |\psi_{x_2 x_2}^N|_{L^1}) &\leq |\psi_{x_1 x_2}^N|_{L^1}. \end{aligned}$$

Note that, for  $u = (u^1, u^2) \in W^{1, \infty}(\Omega; \mathbb{R}^2)$ ,

$$\iint_{\Omega} (u_{x_1}^1 + u_{x_2}^2) \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 = \iint_{\Omega} (u_{x_2}^1 \psi_{x_1 x_1}^N + u_{x_1}^2 \psi_{x_2 x_2}^N) dx_1 dx_2$$

and hence

$$\left| \iint_{\Omega} \operatorname{div} u \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 \right| \leq |u|_{W^{1, \infty}}.$$

Since  $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} |\psi_{x_1 x_2}^N|_{L^1} = \infty$ , using Banach-Steinhaus we can find  $f \in C^0$  such that

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \left| \iint_{\Omega} f \psi_{x_1 x_2}^N dx_1 dx_2 \right| = \infty.$$

Combining the above facts we have even shown that there is  $f \in C^0$  such that no vector field  $u \in W^{1, \infty}(\Omega; \mathbb{R}^2)$  can satisfy  $\operatorname{div} u = f$ .

Of course this result immediately extends to higher dimensions.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank G. Mingione for pointing to us the reference of D. Preiss. This research was, in part, financially supported by the Troisième Cycle Romand, the EPFL, PRIN 2000 and NSF grant DMS-97-04762.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] J. BERGH - J. LÖFSTRÖM, *Interpolation spaces: an introduction*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin 1976.
- [2] J. BOURGAIN - H. BREZIS, *Sur l'équation  $\operatorname{div} u = f$* . C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris, ser. I, 334, 2002, 973-976.
- [3] D. GILBARG - N.S. TRUDINGER, *Elliptic partial differential equations of second order*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin 1977.
- [4] C.T. MC MULLEN, *Lipschitz maps and nets in Euclidean space*. Geom. Funct. Anal., 8, 1998, 304-314.
- [5] D. ORNSTEIN, *A non-inequality for differential operators in the  $L^1$  norm*. Arch. Ration. Mech. Anal., 11, 1962, 40-49.
- [6] D. PREISS, *Additional regularity for Lipschitz solutions of PDE*. J. Reine Angew. Math., 485, 1997, 197-207.
- [7] E.M. STEIN, *Singular integrals and differentiability properties of functions*. Princeton University Press, Princeton 1970.



- [8] E.M. STEIN - G. WEISS, *Introduction to Fourier analysis on Euclidean spaces*. Princeton University Press, Princeton 1971.
- [9] L. TARTAR, *Imbedding theorems of Sobolev spaces into Lorentz spaces*. Bollettino UMI, 1-B, 1998, 479-500.
- 

B. Dacorogna:  
Institut de mathématiques, EPFL  
1015 LAUSANNE (Svizzera)  
bernard.dacorogna@dma.epfl.ch

N. Fusco:  
Dipartimento di Matematica e Applicazioni «R. Caccioppoli»  
Università degli Studi di Napoli «Federico II»  
Complesso Universitario Monte S. Angelo  
Via Cintia - 80126 NAPOLI  
n.fusco@unina.it

L. Tartar:  
Department of Mathematical Sciences  
Carnegie Mellon University  
PITTSBURGH, PA 15213 (USA)  
tartar@andrew.cmu.edu